

**Kentucky Board of Education
October 5, 2016 Regular Meeting**

300 Sower Blvd., 5th Floor, Room 514, Frankfort, KY 40601

SUMMARY MINUTES

The Kentucky Board of Education held its regular meeting on October 5, 2016, at 300 Sower Blvd., Frankfort, Kentucky in Room 514. The board conducted the following business:

I. Call to Order - 9:00 a.m. (ET)

Chair Bill Twyman called the meeting to order and announced the following:

- The materials for the meeting are available on the board's online materials site and the web address is posted in the board room or on the department's main webpage.
- Welcome to those viewing the meeting via the web and thanks to the interpreters for supporting the meeting.

II. Approval of Minutes from August 3-4, 2016 Regular Meeting

Chair Twyman asked if there were any additions or corrections to the August 3-4 meeting minutes. Since none came forward, he asked for a motion, second and vote to approve these minutes.

Sam Hinkle moved to approve the August 3-4, 2016, meeting minutes and Roger Marcum seconded the motion. It carried.

III. Introduction of New KDE Employees and Team Member of the Month

Commissioner Pruitt then introduced the following new department employees:

Office of the Commissioner

Aaron Butler, Education Academic Program Manager, Commissioner's Delivery Unit

Office of Finance and Operations

Barbara Eblen, Human Resource Administrator, Division of Resource Management

Leesa Unger, Internal Policy Analyst I, Division of Budget and Financial Management

Office of Teaching and Learning

Carrie McCrary, Program Coordinator, Division of Learning Services

Office of Continuous Improvement and Support

Jason Howard, Education Administration Program Consultant I, Division of Consolidated Plans and Audits

Kristina Catanese, Education Administration Program Consultant I, Division of Innovation and Partner Engagement

Office of Legal, Legislative and Communication Services

Erik Carlsen-Landry, Staff Attorney I

Office of Education Technology

Delores Shirley, Administrative Specialist III, Division of School Technology Planning and Project Management

Team Member of the Month

Chase Bannister, Staff Attorney, Office of Legal, Legislative and Communication Services

IV. Report of the Secretary of the Education and Workforce Development Cabinet

Secretary Hal Heiner indicated that a report on Kentucky's achievement gap had been placed at each member's seat. He noted that incremental gains had been made but he stated not all of these students are moving in the right direction. Heiner suggested that it is necessary to look down into the data. He went on to say that the Prichard Committee's report says that the gap is widening but noted it is encouraging that the Commissioner is speaking out about owning the gap. The Secretary said he hoped the state board would adopt closing the achievement gap as a top priority and would consider a bold approach. He suggested that the board look outside of Kentucky to see what is working and adopt the phrase "Not on my watch."

Roger Marcum responded that at yesterday's work session, the board agreed that closing the achievement gap would be one of its focuses along with opportunities for all children. He continued that funding for a longer school day must be part of this focus.

Mary Gwen Wheeler added that this is not just a school issue but involves societal issues. She pointed out that there are other factors by which disaggregation must occur.

Secretary Heiner then shared that charter schools offer a way to address these issues in 43 other states.

Sam Hinkle asked when the board would take up the issue of charter schools because it currently is not on the board's agenda.

Chair Twyman said he felt the board needs more information before it can make a decision on charter schools.

Hinkle went on to ask if staff is beginning to gather information on this topic for the board.

Grayson Boyd commented that the law must be changed before charter schools can be opened in Kentucky.

Secretary Heiner stated that the Senate passes a bill on charters each session but then the House does not cooperate. He felt the turnaround option is actually charters. Heiner stated the data on charter schools is tremendously positive and he proposed the board take 48 hours to visit schools in three cities.

Gary Houchens interjected that today's discussion shows the board needs to study the issue more. He suggested the board have a work session to explore the research on charter schools.

Mary Gwen Wheeler agreed that a work session would be appropriate.

Roger Marcum pointed out that research had been done by the Prichard Committee that is available on their website. He also noted that the board's previous position was support of charters that were under the control of a local board of education. Marcum said the appropriate place on the board's agenda for this matter is the legislative agenda.

Milton Seymore then commented that he could not see how you turn these students back over to the local board because it is just like going around in a circle.

Commissioner Pruitt added that we do have to do something different because we do not need to let Kentucky continue to have an achievement gap. Sam Hinkle proposed that the board spend ten minutes on next steps for dealing with this issue.

Rich Gimmel requested that Secretary Heiner and Commissioner Pruitt work together to put together a work session on charter schools.

The Commissioner went on to say that the work session would need to occur in November since the legislative agenda comes forward in December.

Secretary Heiner thought a visit to charter schools would be helpful as well as hearing from some national experts.

Chair Twyman indicated that the board would start with scheduling a work session.

Roger Marcum shared that he assumed Commissioner Pruitt would make a recommendation to the board on this issue since he is saying we must own the achievement gap.

Commissioner Pruitt replied that he thinks we may need a utility belt instead of a tool box to address this problem. He indicated a blend of strategies will be needed. He said he would make a recommendation at some point.

V. Report of the President of the Council on Postsecondary Education

President King was not able to be at the meeting but Chair Twyman noted that Jill Compton from his staff was here if there were any questions on his written report. No questions came forward.

VI. Report of the Executive Director of the Education Professional Standards Board

EPSB Executive Director Jimmy Adams was asked if he had any comments beyond his written report. He expressed a thank you to Amanda Ellis, Laura Arnold, Jennifer Baker and Robin Herbert for their support with the teacher recruitment and retention work. Also, he encouraged board

members to access the links to articles on teacher recruitment and retention found in his written report. Adams then noted that we are seeing a downturn in enrollment in teacher preparation programs at the same time that the standards for these programs are rising.

VII. Report of the Commissioner of Education

Commissioner Pruitt was asked if he had comments to add to his written report. He indicated that work on the accountability system is moving forward and pointed out that the Systems Integration Work Group is beginning to put some pieces of the system together. Pruitt noted that the process has been challenging at times but said that some of the struggle has been getting folks out of their comfort zone to look at more innovative ideas. He said that focusing on the achievement gap is one of the concepts at the forefront of the process and looking at the opportunities we offer students. Regarding KSB and KSD, Pruitt conveyed that the schools are off to a good start this school year and stated although there are still challenges at the schools, good progress has been made from a year ago. His final topic was to thank David Couch and Robin Kinney, along with the Project Move Team, for the tremendous job they did in providing a smooth moving experience for department staff.

VIII. Good News Items

Chair Twyman called on the following board members to give items of Good News:

Gary Houchens - Dr. Natalie Mountjoy, director of the Community Campus Life Science Academy in Owensboro, has been named the Project Lead the Way 2016 Biomedical Science Teacher of the Year for the state of Kentucky. The award is sponsored by Project Lead the Way of Kentucky and recognized Mountjoy's outstanding work with students through participation in hands-on, real-world studies on the Owensboro Community and Technical College campus. Under her leadership, the Life Science Academy program was developed in 2012 and serves high school students in the Daviess County, Owensboro Independent and Hancock County Public School Districts as well as in the Owensboro Catholic Schools. The program directly addresses health professional shortage areas and medically underserved populations. Join me in congratulating Dr. Mountjoy on being chosen for this honor and for her outstanding work with students.

Roger Marcum - 16 Kentucky schools earned National Healthy Schools Awards at the bronze level from the Alliance for a Healthier Generation and the Let's Move Active Schools organization. A list of 328 schools was announced by these national groups. Additionally, 1,045 more Kentucky schools are now enrolled in the initiative, on their journey to becoming a healthier school. To receive bronze level recognition, schools had to meet or exceed updated federal nutrition standards for school meals, offer school breakfast to their students every day, meet or exceed snack and beverage requirements for the federal Smart Snacks in School standards, implement district wellness policies and report progress annually and provide students with at least 60 minutes of physical education per week and ensure activity throughout the school day. The schools that received this award in Kentucky were:

Apollo High School
College View Middle School

Owensboro, KY
Owensboro, KY

Hopkins Co Central High School
Howevalley Elementary School
Lyon Co Elementary School
Richardsville Elem School
Sinking Fork Elementary School
Sorgho Elementary School
South Marshall Elementary School
Southwest Calloway Elem School
Sturgis Elementary School
Talton K. Stone Middle School
Trigg Co High School
Union Co High School
Vine Grove Elementary School
Whitesville Elementary School

Madisonville, KY
Cecilia, KY
Eddyville, KY
Bowling Green, KY
Hopkinsville, KY
Owensboro, KY
Benton, KY
Murray, KY
Sturgis, KY
Elizabethtown, KY
Cadiz, KY
Morganfield, KY
Vine Grove, KY
Whitesville, KY

Join me in congratulating these schools on putting a focus on the health needs of their students!

Alesa Johnson - Recently, the U. S. Department of Education named five Kentucky public schools as 2016 National Blue Ribbon Schools, based on their overall academic excellence. The five Kentucky schools and their districts are:

- Gray Middle School Boone Co.
- Johnson Elementary Laurel Co.
- Moyer Elementary Fort Thomas Independent
- Schaffner Traditional Elementary Jefferson Co.
- Southwest Calloway Elementary Calloway Co.

These Kentucky schools are among the 329 public and private, elementary, middle and high schools across the country recognized this year. There also are five private schools in Kentucky named as part of the 2016 cohort of Blue Ribbon Schools. These schools were recognized in the Exemplary High Performing Schools category, which are schools that are among the state's highest performing schools as measured by state assessments. Various student group performance and high school graduation rates also are at the highest levels. Join me in congratulating these five schools on achieving Blue Ribbon status!

At the completion of this segment, Sam Hinkle asked if one or more of these schools could attend a future board meeting to talk about what made them a top level school and become named as Blue Ribbon Schools.

Commissioner Pruitt replied that this can be arranged for a future meeting.

IX. Highlights of 2016 Unbridled Learning Data Release (Review Item) - Associate Commissioner Rhonda Sims - 45-minute presentation/discussion (Strategic Priorities: Next Generation Learners and Next Generation Schools and Districts)

Associate Commissioner Rhonda Sims came forward for this agenda item. She used a PowerPoint posted on the board's online materials site to give highlights of the 2016 Unbridled Learning Data Release. Some of the points she made were:

- The assessment data includes K-Prep, ACT, End-of-Course exams, and the alternate assessment.
- The accountability data includes Next-Generation Learners (77%), Program Reviews (23%), Accountability Classifications, Annual Measurable Objective (AMO), Participation Rate and Graduation Rate and Rewards/Assistance. Each of the indicators under the categories listed above were reported in detail through the PowerPoint and the board members had an opportunity to ask questions.

Roger Marcum raised the issue of meeting the requirements of SB 168, which Senator Neal champions. He noted that an article by Susan Weston questions whether this bill has been implemented. Marcum felt that some clear direction is needed in this area and stated we need to do a better job of shining the light here and reporting the results.

Commissioner Pruitt agreed that we need to continue to move toward improvement in this area and raise the quality of reporting.

Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster came forward and shared that reports from districts regarding SB 168 are due to the department on October 1 and stated that staff are in the process of seeing which districts are missing from turning in the reports.

Marcum moved on to express that he is concerned about how we define college-ready as a test score and also is concerned about how we define career-ready. Sims commented that progress has been made against the measures in the system but acknowledged there are some legitimate issues that have been raised by the board and others that merit examination.

Marcum continued that he questions, as has been raised by Gary Houchens, whether the measure of college- and career-readiness is a true measure of if students are ready.

X. Kentucky Department of Education (KDE) Program Review Audit Process (Action/Discussion Item) - Karen Kidwell, Division Director, Division of Program Standards, Office of Teaching and Learning - 30-minute presentation/discussion - Strategic Priority: Next Generation Learners

Division Director Karen Kidwell explained that she is talking about the audit process for this year only. On page 3 of the staff note, Kidwell said, the changes made to the process appear in a table. She indicated staff has been sensitive to the recommendations of the Program Review Task Force. Overall, Kidwell pointed out that the demonstrators were examined to give more opportunities to show evidence and the whole process has been focused on next steps to improve programs.

Roger Marcum then asked for LSAC's reaction to the proposal.

Kidwell replied that LSAC was overwhelmingly positive about the proposal.

Gary Houchens asked if the audits seek to look at the accuracy of self-rating.

Kidwell responded affirmatively.

Houchens continued by asking if there are no consequences if overrating occurs.

Kidwell replied that is correct and said this was not done in the past.

Chair Twyman then asked for a motion, second and vote to approve the Program Review Audit process.

Motion Passed: Approval of the Kentucky Department of Education Program Review Audit Process passed with a motion by Mr. Samuel Hinkle and a second by Mr. Roger Marcum.

Mr. Grayson Boyd	Yes
Mr. Ben Cundiff	Absent
Mr. Richard Gimmel	Yes
Mr. Samuel Hinkle	Yes
Mr. Gary Houchens	Yes
Ms. Alesa Johnson	Yes
Mr. Roger Marcum	Yes
Ms. Nawanna Privett	Yes
Mr. Milton Seymore	Yes
Mr. William Twyman	Yes
Ms. Mary Gwen Wheeler	Yes

XI. Update on Kentucky's Plan to Close Achievement Gaps Through Novice Reduction (Review Item) - Kelly Foster, Associate Commissioner of Continuous Improvement and Support - 30-minute presentation/discussion - Strategic Priority: Next Generation Schools and Districts

Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster and Linda Raines came forward to talk about this agenda item. Linda Raines gave a brief overview of this work. It was noted this is the last year of some districts to be in the pilot and that the process is not yet implemented statewide. A PowerPoint was used to make the following points:

- Curriculum and Standards, Instruction, Continuous Improvement and Assessment and Environment and Support are all involved in the Novice Reduction Initiative.
- In reading, there are 80,026 novice students and in math, there are 59,529 students.
- A graphic showing the key core work processes used in the process was displayed and explained.

- The resources on the webpage for novice reduction were shown.
- Data comparing the performance of districts in the pilot versus those not in the pilot were shown.
- As far as where we are going with the initiative, the plan is to provide leadership with a sequential change model that empowers them to cultivate sustainable change in their schools and districts, create urgency within the Key Core Work Processes in order to develop systems of change and identify highly effective classroom strategies that reduce novice performance and improve student learning. Novice reduction is slow, deliberate work that is about changing culture and changing instruction. 30 workshops are scheduled across the state on novice reduction between now and November.
- Department staff has been in every county in the state over the last year talking about novice reduction. We are seeing people embrace this work.

At this point, local district staff from Somerset Independent, Johnson County and Garrard County came forward and talked about the novice reduction efforts in their districts.

XII. Board Member Sharing

Bill Twyman asked if any member had something to share.

Mary Gwen Wheeler shared that she has been asked to join the National Data Quality Campaign, which will give her access to what other states are doing regarding data in response to the Every Student Succeeds Act. She said she will bring forward information to the board from this initiative that may be useful.

XIII. Hearing Officer's Report

General Counsel Kevin Brown noted that the Hearing Officer's Report on regulations is posted on the board's online materials site.

XIV. Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee Meeting (11:45 a.m. ET; Tentative Time)

Committee Chair Nawanna Privett called the committee meeting to order.

XIV.A. Action/Consent Items

XIV.A.1. Kentucky Writing Program Advisory Committee Appointment (Strategic Priority: Next Generation Learners)

Division Director Karen Kidwell came forward for this item. She noted that staff is recommending Susan Norton for appointment to the Writing Program Advisory Committee.

Committee Chair Privett asked for a motion, second and vote to approve this appointment.

Mary Gwen Wheeler moved approval of Susan Norton's appointment and Gary Houchens seconded the motion. It carried.

XIV.A.2. KY Tech Policies and Procedures Amendments (Strategic Priority: Next Generation Schools and Districts)

David Horseman, Leslee Slaughter and Chase Bannister came forward for this item. They noted that after discussion of the amendments with the chair and vice chair of the Curriculum Committee, the order of the amendments were revisited. Approval of the amendments were recommended.

Committee Chair Privett then asked for a motion, second and vote to approve the KY Tech Policies and Procedures amendments.

Gary Houchens moved approval and Mary Gwen Wheeler seconded the motion. It carried.

XV. Lunch - 12:00 noon - 1:00 p.m. ET (Lunch provided for KBE members, invited guests and commissioner's planning committee members only)

XVI. Public Comment Segment (1:00 p.m. ET)

Nobody came forward for the Public Comment segment.

XVII. Management Committee Meeting (1:15 p.m. ET; Tentative Time)

Committee Chair Grayson Boyd called the meeting to order.

XVII.A. Action/Consent Items

XVII.A.1. New District Facility Plans: Johnson County and Owen County (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

Donna Duncan and Robin Kinney came forward for this agenda item. It was noted that all of these districts' plans meet the requirements and staff recommended their approval.

At this point, Committee Chair Boyd asked for a motion, second and vote to approve all submitted district facility plans.

Alesa Johnson moved approval of the plans and Roger Marcum seconded the motion. It carried.

XVII.A.2. 2016-17 Local District Tax Rates Levied (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

Robin Kinney, Donna Duncan and Chay Ritter came forward for this agenda item. Ritter explained the process of how tax rates work.

Roger Marcum expressed concern about the 14 districts not taking the 4%. Commissioner Pruitt then suggested that it might be a good idea for Ritter to do a session on how SEEK works in the future.

Marcum added that it also would be good to include how facilities are funded.

Committee Chair Boyd then asked for a motion, second and vote to approve the submitted tax rates.

Roger Marcum so moved and Milton Seymore seconded the motion. It carried.

XVII.A.3. Request for Waiver from 702 KAR 4:050, Section 4(4)(a), Requirement that the Hopkins County Board of Education Acquire Mineral Rights Forbearance Prior to Purchasing a Property in Madisonville, Kentucky (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

Donna Duncan explained that the committee saw a similar request from this district at the last meeting but said this request involves a different piece of property. She said they cannot do a fee simple title. Duncan indicated staff recommends approval of the waiver.

Committee Chair Boyd then asked for a motion, second and vote to approve the waiver request from Hopkins County.

Roger Marcum moved approval and Alesa Johnson seconded the motion. It carried.

The committee meeting then adjourned.

XVII.B. Review Items

XVII.B.1. Audit Update and Review of the Kentucky Board of Education's and Commissioner of Education's Expense Reports (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

Division Director Charles Harman and Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney came forward for this item. Harman explained where the department stands on the various audits and also used the expenditure charts to update the board on the commissioner's and board's expenses to date. He noted that the department makes sure audit firms are following the accepted standards for audits.

XVII.B.2. Status Update on State Assistance in Fleming and Robertson Counties and Caverna Independent (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

The superintendents from Caverna Independent, Fleming and Robertson Counties shared the excellent progress they had made on the recent assessment and accountability data release.

Roger Marcum stated that if more resources/capacity were available for Priority Schools, the gap might be closed.

XVII.B.3. Status Update on State Management in Breathitt and Menifee Counties (KDE Support and Guiding Processes)

The state managers shared the progress that has been made on the recent assessment and accountability data release in Breathitt and Menifee Counties. Kelly Foster was recognized for her excellent work in both the state-assisted and state-managed districts as well as Jim Hamm and Tim Spencer.

XVIII. Approval of Action/Consent Items as a Block (Full Board Meeting Resumes)

Board Chair Bill Twyman asked for a motion, second and vote to approve the action/consent items of all submitted new district facility plans, all submitted local district tax rates, request for waiver from 702 KAR 4:050, Section 4(4)(a), Requirement that the Hopkins County Board of Education Acquire Mineral Rights Forbearance Prior to Purchasing a Property in Madisonville, Kentucky, appointment of Susan Norton to the Kentucky Writing Program Advisory Committee and the KY Tech Policies and Procedures amendments.

Grayson Boyd moved approval of all action/consent items and Mary Gwen Wheeler seconded the motion. The motion carried with Sam Hinkle voting no.

XIX. KDE Employment Report (All offices except Career and Technical Education)

No questions came forward on this report.

XX. KDE Employment Report (Office of Career and Technical Education)

Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney shared that department staff will be meeting with KCTCS staff for possible strategies for increasing minority staff since that organization was selected by the Urban League for an award.

XXI. Internal Board Business

The following items came forward during Internal Board Business:

Mary Ann Miller was asked to poll dates in November for the special meeting to study charter schools. Commissioner Pruitt shared that the department will be releasing a new RFI for Educational Management Organizations that could affect those who could apply if the board visits their facilities to view some charter schools. Gary Houchens added that the board might want to look at previously proposed bills on charters that the legislature has considered. Mary Gwen Wheeler asked that the Prichard Committee Report be included as a resource and Gary Houchens requested that the Stanford research be included.

The board was asked to approve Bill Twyman's travel to the NASBE Conference. Nawanna Privett moved to approve the travel and Grayson Boyd seconded the motion. It carried.

The board was asked to approve Roger Marcum's trip to the SREB meeting as part of the state's team. Gary Houchens moved to approve the travel and Rich Gimmel seconded the motion. It carried.

Mary Ann Miller was asked to draft criteria for an award honoring David Karem and work with Roger Marcum, Grayson Boyd and Rich Gimmel to review the criteria.

Mary Ann Miller was asked to arrange a holiday dinner for the board on the evening of Dec. 6.

XXII. Sharing of the Results of Discussion on Commissioner's Self-Evaluation with the Commissioner (Review Item)

Mary Gwen Wheeler was asked by Chair Twyman to verbally share the results from yesterday's discussion on the commissioner's evaluation with the commissioner. She shared the following strengths:

- A willingness to challenge authority if he believes something is wrong.
- The ability to build relationships with constituency groups.
- His accessibility to people across the state.
- The credibility he has established through communication and the ability to listen.
- His emphasis on equity and access.
- The ability to make tough decisions.
- His seriousness about being the superintendent of KSB and KSD.
- The ability to establish relationships on both sides of the aisle in the General Assembly.
- His presentation of a consistent message with different audiences.
- His display of toughness when necessary.
- The ability to manage through a time of transition in state government.
- The establishment of a good process for development of a new assessment and accountability system.
- His formation of a Dyslexia Task Force.
- The establishment of student work as the keystone of the new science assessment.
- The embracement of living in Kentucky.
- His cultivation of a culture of collaboration both inside and outside of the department.

Rather than identify areas for growth since the strategic plan is not yet finalized, Wheeler said the board decided to identify potential areas for future goals as follows:

- Develop and implement a new strategic plan,
- Increase the use of social media.
- Identify the audiences for written communications and provide a focus for them.
- Continue to focus on novice reduction.
- Provide clarity around the most effective way to reduce novices.
- Focus on closing the achievement gap.
- Determine how we are going to provide equity and opportunity.
- Make sure the science assessment gets implemented.
- Continue to improve KSB and KSD.
- Draft and implement regulations in response to ESSA.
- Merge career and technical education and academics.
- Move the department into being more involved in the modeling of curriculum and best practices.
- Clarify the department's role in professional learning.
- Strengthen the connection with higher education and also with pre-K.
- Continue to visit schools and districts.

- Clarify innovation as a strategy to address the gap and other issues.
- Work with industry on communication.
- Conduct a 360 survey with department staff on the commissioner's performance/effectiveness.
- Conduct a customer satisfaction survey with constituents.

Chair Twyman asked Commissioner Pruitt to come back with performance goals at the next meeting.

Commissioner Pruitt said he appreciates the board's support. He noted that the areas for goals were already on his list anyway but said he also wants to look at ways to engage the board at KSB and KSD.

Chair Twyman summarized that the verbal feedback will be written up into an official document that will be brought forward for approval in December.

XXIII. Litigation Report

No request to go into closed session for discussion of the Litigation Report was made.

XXIV. Adjournment

Sam Hinkle then moved to adjourn the meeting and Milton Seymore seconded the motion. It carried.

XXV. State Evaluation Appeals Panel (Will convene upon adjournment of the full board meeting) - Room 517 at 300 Sower Blvd., Frankfort, KY

Nawanna Privett, Grayson Boyd and Rich Gimmel met to complete the work of the State Evaluation Appeals Panel.