

**Kentucky Board of Education – Regular Meeting
April 11, 2018**

**300 Sower Boulevard, 5th Floor (Room 514)
Frankfort, Kentucky 40601**

SUMMARY MINUTES

The Kentucky Board of Education (KBE) held its regular meeting on Wednesday, April 11, 2018, in the State Board Room on the Fifth Floor of the 300 Building, located at 300 Sower Boulevard, Frankfort, Kentucky. The board conducted the following business:

I. Call to Order

Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler called the meeting to order at 8:36 a.m. ET.

II. Roll Call of Members and Advisors

Chair Wheeler asked Becky Blessing to call the roll of members and advisors. Member Ben Cundiff was not present for roll call, but there was still a quorum of voting members. Cundiff joined the meeting later. CPE President Bob King (ex-officio member) and all four board advisors also were present.

Present Board Members:

Mr. Grayson Boyd
Mr. Ben Cundiff
Mr. Richard Gimmel
Mr. Samuel Hinkle
Mr. Gary Houchens
Ms. Alesa Johnson
Mr. Roger Marcum
Ms. Nawanna Privett
Mr. Milton Seymore
Mr. William Twyman
Ms. Mary Gwen Wheeler
CPE President Bob King (ex-officio member)

Present Advisors:

Tracy Cusick
Kathy Gornik
Wayne Lewis
Joe Papalia

Chair Wheeler recognized that for several board members this was the last meeting of their term. Wheeler said she wanted to honor the outgoing member's board service and would like to put that in context through her remarks. She said during the past eight years, the board collectively has:

- set two accountability systems
- established new standards for English/language arts, math and science
- considered social studies standards and looked at world language expectations
- defined what college and career readiness is

All of which has been with the goals of increasing all students' capacity to compete in our 21st

century economy.

She went on to say the board also has:

- provided a framework for professionals with standards for teachers and principals;
- set expectations for school improvement; and
- established recognitions for excellence.

Wheeler said the state has made considerable improvements during this time but acknowledged circumstances for many families also have changed during this time including a decrease in wages, the onset of the opioid crisis and an increase in safety concerns. She said the board needs to keep looking at the work that remains to be done including closing the achievement gap.

She said the state must keep innovating, and even in lean times need to figure out how to do better and keep “an eye on the prize” that students continue to achieve and are kept at the heart of education improvements.

III. Approval of Consent Agenda

Chair Wheeler asked board members whether they would like to remove any items from the consent agenda to discuss separately. Items on the consent agenda for this meeting included the following:

III.A. Action Items

1. *Approval of the Summary Minutes for the February 7, 2018, Regular Meeting*

III.B. Information Items

1. *Kentucky Department of Education (KDE) Combined Employment Report (All Offices including Career and Technical Education)*
2. *Litigation Report*

While not asking that it be removed from the consent agenda, board member Twyman asked that KDE continue to consider to focus on employment of minorities especially in Career and Technical Education.

With no other discussion, Samuel Hinkle moved, and Alesa Johnson seconded a motion to approve the consent agenda. The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

IV. Report of the Secretary of Education and Workforce Development Cabinet

Secretary Heiner started by talking about the results of the National Assessment for Educational Progress, also known as NAEP. He said on the surface things do not look too bad with Kentucky near the national average, but he asked that board disaggregate the data. He said while the overall state results stayed about the same, there was a significant increase in the number of student scoring below basic.

Heiner called for a focus on 3rd grade reading. He said up to 3rd grade, students learn to read and

after that, they read to learn. In looking at Jefferson Co. Schools data on KPREP – 32 of every 100 students score in the novice category (not able to understand a text). Statewide 20 in every 100 students are in the novice category (when JCPS is excluded). According to Heiner, in some states where they are doing detailed K-3 intervention services, the number drops to 12.

Heiner said it is KBE's and the commissioner's responsibility to do better for kids. He said we all need to work together to bring achievement up. He cites Indiana as a good example of a state that is doing better because it provides more choices for meeting the needs of students.

Heiner thanked the board for its service in what he sees is the most important role in the Commonwealth of Kentucky, service on the state board of education.

Rich Gimmel asked if the board should be doing something different specifically. Heiner said other states are using a different approach such as longer hours, wraparound services – including medical and housing – more instructional time and catch up time. Heiner said a framework needs to be established that allows students to catch up. He said programs are often initiated through specialized management organizations and charters, which encourage individual learning programs for these kids to make it.

Grayson Boyd said the state once had summer school and ESS (extended school services), but the state stopped funding them.

Heiner responded that one principal at J.B. Atkinson in Jefferson Co. went to the university and asked for master's program at the university to provide more professional development, then went to the corporate community to provide summer school. Heiner said the achievement scores took off as a result, with no additional state funding. He thinks the corporate community is ready to help.

In another case, Heiner cited an Indianapolis inner city school is sending 95% of its students to postsecondary. He asked how that is happening. He said there are ways, but we have to be responsible for creating those ways.

Mary Gwen Wheeler said all districts have different needs and the board has to be flexible enough with its frameworks to ensure all districts can meet student needs.

The full report from Secretary Heiner can be found on the KBE online materials site.

V. Report of the President of the Council on Postsecondary Education (CPE)

President King focused a lot of his report on the budget and the fact that postsecondary will be cut.

King commented on Sec. Heiner's report and importance of disaggregating data and looking at lower performing students and how to bring them to high achievement levels. King says even though scores do not reflect higher levels of learning, many students are graduating, but they are not ready.

King said Kentucky needs to look at higher performing countries to see what they are doing. He

said the fundamental structure is insufficient. We need teachers who are more effective, pay better, are provided the professional development they need, and superintendents need to be able to hire principals.

Chair Wheeler congratulated President King on his retirement.

Member Houchens asked President King about the funding portion of his report. Houchens said a performance-based funding model increases dollars. However, increased pension costs exceed any gains and leave universities such as Western Kentucky University at a deficit. King said UK and University of Louisville are not affected because they are not in the state pension system. King said there would be an impact of increased employer contributions which varies among comprehensive universities. He said campuses are dependent on state operating support, yet have fixed costs such as pension costs, health costs, etc. which are putting more dependence on tuition.

The full report from President King can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VI. Report of the Executive Director of the Education Professional Standards Board (EPSB)

EPSB Executive Director Jimmy Adams points out that current budget does not allow for Kentucky Teacher or Kentucky Principal Internship Programs and there is a question on whether districts would have to carry out these programs at their own expense because of the statutory requirement. He said a possible suspension of programs is an alternative. Adams said not having a program is a disservice to new teachers. He said right now Kentucky has a 3-year retention rate of 90 percent, where nationally it is about 70 percent. He voiced concerns that we may backslide by not providing teachers support when they are starting out.

Adams said KDE and EPSB are forming task forces on school counselors. KDE will look at what their role and responsibilities should be. EPSB will be looking at what standards for certification should be.

Twyman says KTIP is an internship program and if we are to improve, it should continue.

Privett says KTIP has been essential for new teachers, for them to get counsel from master teachers.

King says in highest performing countries, they take the process of inducting new teachers seriously and it is critical to the success of teachers. He feels that doing away with the KTIP program will have real consequences and be detrimental to the state.

King said guidance counselors are critical and we often load them up with other duties so there is no one to counsel students on their future. He said anything we can do to support those going into this area is positive and will help improve outcomes for kids.

Heiner asked Adams if he had looked at a JCPS pilot program where the focus was to have interaction with more than one master teacher through technology. Heiner said it would be interesting to see results.

The full report from Executive Director Adams can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VII. Report of the Commissioner of Education

Commissioner Pruitt commented on his first year of teaching and how important it is to have good mentors.

Pruitt said as part of individual education and assessment, and social/emotional welfare of students, KDE is focusing on counselors as a priority. Robin McCoy is coordinating counselors statewide and is starting to coordinate counselors who are critical to advise students as we move toward a new more meaningful diploma. Pruitt said the department held its first counseling meeting. He believes that we should put guidelines in place such as 80 percent of counselors time should be spent on counseling and no more than 20 percent on other things. Kentucky is not using counselors like other states, he said. Pruitt said we are underutilizing counselors. KDE is starting to work to make counselors are more effective.

Pruitt said he is starting town halls on Thursday and everyone is invited. He said it is nice to get out and see what is going on in the field and visit schools. The topic is graduation requirements. After gathering feedback, staff will be coming back to KBE in June with ideas. The biggest challenge is to change how we think about grad requirements – to think more broadly about concepts rather than courses. He says KBE needs to think about how they validate the high school diploma, so we can feel confident that students are prepared.

The commissioner said we are going to be discussing K-3 literacy at next board meeting. Achievement gaps are not acceptable, he said.

Pruitt recognized the 100th anniversary of PTA and what a great partner they are. He recognized Debbie Wesslund, PTA board member. The commissioner said the PTA is going to be an important partner moving forward on projects, such as school report card and parent engagement strategies.

Commissioner Pruitt welcomed new KDE employees. Those recognized were:

Office of Continuous Improvement and Support

- *Michelle Campbell, Administrative Specialist III, Division of Student Success*
- *Whitney Crowe, KBE/KDE Education Academic Program Manager*

Office of Finance and Operations

- *Amy Ortwein, Program Coordinator, Division of Resource Management, Physical Resource Branch*
- *Kanaka Aspari, Administrative Specialist III, Division of Resource Management*

Office of Teaching and Learning

- *Kimberly McDaniel, Administrative Specialist III, Division of Program Standards*
- *Carol Ann Morrison, Exceptional Children's Consultant, Division of Learning Services*

Office of Career and Technical Education

- *Landon Tingle, KBE/KDE Education Academic Program Manager*

Milton Seymore asked Commissioner Pruitt how the audit in Jefferson County was going. Pruitt responded that there was one piece they were waiting on and that it was not in the board's or Jefferson County Schools' best interest to discuss it at this time.

The full report given by Commissioner Pruitt can be found on the KBE online materials site.

VIII. Good News Items

Rich Gimmel shared that he had an opportunity to visit Muhlenberg South Middle School. He said there is a lot we can learn from these folks. They have been able to significantly improve performance through effective leadership, despite a 10% across the board budget cut and low morale of previous years. Gimmel recognized the school for the improvement they have made, the efficiencies they have demonstrated, and for the enthusiasm and passion they have for transforming the lives of young people. They are showing what can be done, he said.

In other good news, Mary Gwen Wheeler pointed out that Addie Clarkson, a Kentucky School for the Blind (KSB) first grade student, sang the national anthem at a recent University of Louisville women's basketball game. Wheeler said the young student's voice is amazing and her enthusiasm was infectious.

Pruitt reminded the board that graduation for KSB and the Kentucky School for the Deaf (KSD) is coming up and encouraged board members to attend. He also thanked the board members who attended the recent groundbreaking for the new elementary school at KSD in Danville.

IX. Hearing Officer's Report

A. Statement of Consideration for 703 KAR 5:280, School Improvement procedures.

Hearing officer Kevin Brown reported that the regulation went through 30 day review period. No one attended the public hearing. KDE received one comment, from Dr. Joe Burks, Education Policy Analyst for the Kentucky Senate Majority, which triggered the Statement of Consideration.

Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster went through comments in the Statement of Consideration. Staff recommended several changes to the regulation as the result of comments made through the Statement of Consideration. Other comments did not result in changes.

Nawanna Privett moved, and Samuel Hinkle seconded that the KBE approve the Statement of Consideration as presented. The motion passed on a unanimous voice vote.

X. High School Graduation Requirements: A Look Across the Country

Jennifer Zinth from the non-partisan, non-profit Education Commission of the States presented a national look at high school graduation requirements. She said many states had been working on revising graduation requirements. Zinth outlined definitions, how Kentucky compares nationally, competency-based models, end-of-course exams, "Carnegie Plus," and endorsements to the standard diploma.

She said four New England states have abandoned the requirement of Carnegie Units in favor of a competency-based model. New Hampshire was first to adopt this model in 2005. There, students' progress is based on demonstration of competencies required for college and career readiness success, not seat time. It is left up to each high school to outline what those competencies are. Each high school's instructional program must include those competencies and techniques for evaluation of student outcomes, including performance assessment of competencies. Students can demonstrate competencies in a variety of ways and can "test out" of competencies or cover multiple competencies through interdisciplinary courses.

Joe Papilia asked if there were any states that had common competency standards. In New Hampshire, the answer is no. Commissioner Pruitt said the local control model would not be a consideration that Kentucky is likely to adopt. New Hampshire has a testing pilot agreement that is competency-based through a special agreement with the United States Department of Education.

Rhode Island implemented its graduation requirements in 2016 and cited 20 courses that students must take, much like Kentucky. However, the regulation states that completion of the course is based on competency, not seat time and the student can move on when ready. A student can fulfill multiple course requirements with a single course if aligned to state content standards. The Local Education Agency (LEA) has to document the standards a student had to attain and also assess whether the student has meant standards.

In Vermont, a student must demonstrate proficiency in the curriculum in literacy, math content and practices, scientific inquiry and content knowledge, global citizenship, PE and health education (1.5 years) and transferable skills (communication, collaboration, creativity, innovation, inquiry, problem solving, use of technology). Credits may not be based on seat time, and students may receive credit for learning that takes place outside school.

In Maine, for the class of 2025, students must demonstrate standards-based competency in English/language arts (E/LA), math, science and technology, social studies and four additional areas. The school certifies that student has demonstrated proficiency in meeting state standards.

Milton Seymore asked why these states took this approach. Zinth says these states are very independent. Commissioner Pruitt said that these states also used to be a part of NECAP (New England Common Assessment Program).

Zinth reported that half of the states, including Kentucky, are administering End-of-Course exams in one or more subject areas. Some factor into a student's course grade, some do not. Some states use EOC as an exit exam; some do not.

"Carnegie Plus" is a trend that requires students to achieve measures of college/career-readiness (CCR). Indiana has adopted a model that uses Carnegie units, national exams, out of classroom experience, a portfolio of work and attainment of soft skills. Effective with the class of 2023, students must complete Carnegie units in one of four diploma pathways AND demonstrate

employability skills and postsecondary-ready competencies.

Effective with the class of 2021, Colorado students must show CCR in ELA and math but have a menu of options. Districts determine which options to make available to students.

In Texas, in addition to Carnegie units and passing five end-of-course assessments, students must demonstrate proficiency in soft skills such as verbal communication, listening, critical thinking and problem solving.

Additionally, more states are taking on endorsements to a standard diploma. Indiana is piloting a work-ready endorsement now. The number and types of endorsements vary.

Ohio is the only state that offers a statewide work-ready endorsement in 15 areas that show work readiness. (effective with the class of 2018). The state has developed a rubric to show where a student can be expert or proficient or needs more work. Need a minimum of 3 mentors and two environments (work, school, community) to complete.

Rich Gimmel asked if these changes have impacted grad rates. Zinth said they have not. In Indiana, more students are seeking core 40 diploma or two advanced diploma options. If students wanted to go into general diploma option, they had to sit down with a counselor and their parent so they knew they would probably not meet college entrance requirements.

Gornick said state control under KERA has not worked out well and local control such as in New Hampshire and Vermont has fostered innovation. In Kentucky, Pruitt says the state sets graduation requirements and has to ensure quality, though districts decide if students are ready to graduate. He says the balance between innovation and quality is key and cited the competency pilot. Lewis says we have to let schools and districts be flexible and innovative, but the state must set a minimum bar for outcomes.

Milton Seymore is pushing for a diploma where an employer knows the graduate has been through a discipline and is ready for the job.

Houchens indicated he likes competency-based models.

Lewis said in some states there is flexibility for students headed to 4-year college as well as 2-year education or the workforce. He wants to look at states that have been very intentional about pathways that prepare kids well for careers that don't require a 4-year degree. Zinth says Ohio, Indiana and Colorado all are examples. Lewis asked about Virginia. Zinth says the Virginia state board established a profile of a graduate, and said in addition to Carnegie units and 6 EOCs, the student must demonstrate 5Cs (employability skills).

Pruitt says he wants to see Kentucky use technology to track competencies. Pruitt does not mind seeing the graduation rate drop if students are better prepared. He said the staff is currently working

on a Profile of Graduate that is aligned with receiving entities and what they require. He said aptitude and attitude establish a child's altitude.

Alesa Johnson reported that spent the day working on the Profile of Graduate, and thinks we are moving in the right direction. She said there was tremendous turnout from business and industry in all 16 sectors. She said it was a great meeting and were broken up into sectors where they went through series of 7 or 8 questions. People were very engaged. Her takeaway was that there was general agreement by business and industry that we needed to change graduation requirements.

Associate Commissioner Laura Arnold passed out a report from the Southern Regional Education Board on its Profile of a Graduate work.

XI. Legislative Update on the 2018 Session of the Kentucky General Assembly

Associate Commissioner Kevin Brown reported that the General Assembly would meet Friday and Saturday for final two days of the session. He reported that a handful of education bills have passed. Policy advisor Tracy Goff Herman reported that we are eight days into the first veto period and after the general Assembly adjourns the governor will have an additional 10 days to veto legislation. She reported that many bills are outstanding. HB 200 (budget bill) and HB 366 (revenue bill), which the governor vetoed and sent back to the legislature, have been the main focus as well as the pension bill which passed and the governor signed.

Goff Herman went on to outline the education-related bills that have passed the General Assembly and those that remain in play.

XII. Local School District Finances (Review Item) Due to time and the presenter's schedule, Chair Wheeler moved this item to the afternoon session with no objection and moved forward with the agenda.

XIII. Presentation of the 2018 Dr. Johnnie Grissom and Samuel Robinson Awards

Board Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler announced the 2018 Dr. Johnnie Grissom Award goes to Dr. Soraya Matthews, director of curriculum, instruction and assessment for the Fayette County Public Schools. The award recognizes those who exhibit leadership, commitment and service to promote high student achievement through instructional equity and in closing the achievement gap for all children. Matthews thanked her husband for his support and the school district, both of which encourage her to be a trailblazer and do more. She pledged to continue the work and said while she appreciates the award it is about the work for the children.

Chair Wheeler announced the 2018 Samuel Robinson Award is given to the Black Males Working (BMW) Academy. The award recognizes an individual or group in Kentucky for outstanding leadership, commitment and service in promoting equity and opportunity to learn at high levels for all Kentucky students. BMW co-founder Dr. Roszalyn Akins accepted the award along with some of the program scholars. Co-founder Dr. Roger Cleveland was not able to attend due to being out of state. Akins said BMW is a mentoring program that provides disadvantaged males of color an opportunity to listen to dynamic presenters, accelerate their learning through tutoring and explore

their country and other parts of the world through field trips. She said the academy is a prime example of what happens when the business community, the faith community, and school system work together to make a difference in the lives of young people. Over its 14 years, Akins said the Saturday program has grown from 40 boys at one site to 300 young men across four sites. The scholars are expected to be well behaved, well mannered, well dressed; well read, well spoken and well travelled, which leads them to be well prepared. She said the program educates, motivates and activates the potential for excellence to break stereotypes and bring out the best in young men.

Member Sam Hinkle asked why there are not programs like this across the state. Ben Cundiff says it was because it was grass roots and didn't happen from the top down – it started at the local level. Gimmel says the board may need to work to remove barriers to foster these kinds of programs across the state. Akins says the program could be replicated across the commonwealth as long as there is someone with a commitment to do so.

Also, Mary Gwen Wheeler and Commissioner Pruitt publicly acknowledged the service of former Board Executive Director Leslie Slaughter, who resigned from the department in March.

Commissioner Pruitt thanked board members whose terms are expiring and for bringing him to Kentucky.

XIV. LUNCH

At 11:53 a.m., Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler announced a break for lunch and that the meeting would resume at 1 p.m.

XV. Public Comment Segment

No one signed up to speak to the board.

XVI. Local School District Finances (Review Item) *NOTE: This item was rescheduled from morning session due to presenter's schedule.*

Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney introduced Susan Barkley, the Director of Finance for the Shelby Co. schools for a presentation on the financial process for budgeting. The district is in the top 20 in size in the state and has experienced student growth and growth in property assessments.

Barkley presented the school district business cycle, which involves work from the prior year, current year and future year. The fiscal year starts July 1.

The budget cycle starts in January with the production of the draft budget by Jan. 30. The district receives tentative allocations by March 1. This is critical since 80-85% of the budget is personnel costs and they have to notify staff of reductions by April 30. Final school allocations are determined by May with a tentative budget in place by May 30 and a working budget in place September 30.

Barkley said the district measures results by financial statements and tests compliance with federal grants. The effectiveness of dollars spent is measured through continuous monitoring of student progress and outcomes.

Gornick asked what percentage of the budget is dependent on the tax rate. Barkley said it is almost the entire budget – very little money comes from federal revenue – the majority of the budget is dependent on state and local revenue. In strong revenue districts, local district support is larger than state. In poor revenue districts, state support is greater than local. When assessments go up, districts get more local revenue, but this is offset by a decrease in state revenues through the SEEK calculation, though it is not a dollar for dollar offset

Gimmel asked if rates impacted that. Barkley responded that the offset is based on assessments and that if the local school board raises the rate to generate more funds, those additional funds stay at the local level.

Gornick asked what other revenues were available to support districts. Barkley answered that there is a very small portion that is federal grants and some state competitive grants, but this varies from district to district, and the monies are restricted as to their use.

Barkley discussed the various roles in the budgeting process including the board, superintendent, finance officer, budget administrators (principals and department heads), SBDM councils and staff.

She said the total budget of a district is made up of various “buckets” of funds – the largest is the **general fund** (unrestricted SEEK and local revenues) and is board directed. **Special revenue** is made up of grants funds that can be spent only as the grant allows. **Capital outlay** (SEEK revenue restricted for capital projects) and **building funds** (restricted local taxes and SEEK revenue restricted for capital projects) are accumulated resources. These funds are then expended in one of two ways, through a **construction fund** (restricted for active capital project expenditures) or for **debt service**, which is a conduit for bond payments. Districts also have a **food service fund** which is made up of restricted grant funds (not included in special revenue) to ensure the program is self-supporting.

As for revenue considerations, they must balance expenditures. If short, boards must consider whether a tax rate increase would be detrimental to taxpayers or if the compensating rate may be detrimental if assessments have plummeted. Another option is grants, but these may have costly strings attached Barkley said.

Roger Marcum asked if there was any financial reason for a district not to take the 4%. She said no and that it benefits a district over time because it builds.

Bill Twyman asked how much flexibility a local board has regarding fixed costs such as staffing. Barkley said there are certain minimum requirements a state must maintain. Rich Gimmel asked how much flexibility a local board has on things like salaries. Barkley said a district could reduce the salary schedule, but this is problematic. It is better to try and reduce staff if possible through attrition or cut other positions that are not subject to the minimum level and have people do multiple jobs (such as central office staff).

Gornik asked what was included in supplies. Supplies include actual supplies such as paper and pencils, textbooks, instructional furniture and expenditures under \$5,000, as well as utilities. Barkley said.

As for expenditure considerations, Barkley told the board that these must be prioritized with staffing being funded first, followed by other direct costs of instruction such as instructional materials, transportation and utilities. Whatever is left can be used for indirect costs of instruction such as maintenance, payroll and administration, she said. Barkley said many things are mandated and what districts have control of spending money on is very small.

Kinney said there is a central financial system called MUNIS and KDE trains districts on how to code. Gary Houchens asked how much confidence we can have in our per pupil reporting under ESSA? Kinney said there would be guidance either from the feds or the state on how to report certain expenses that may be in question.

Barkley said districts are required to have a 2% contingency for emergencies. She believes this is too low to cover major catastrophes.

Gimmel asked about the pensions and the rates employers must pay. It is 19% for classified staff, and if there is no cap, it will go up by 46% for next year. Barkley said pensions would be one third of a classified staff person's salary in the new biennium. For teachers, the district must pay 3%.

Marcum asked about the 2% contingency fund. Barkley said the 2% contingency is not enough and should be based on two months operating expenses. Kinney said each district is different and its contingency can include funds set aside for building, etc.

XVII. 2018-2020 Executive Budget recommendation regarding P-12 education (Review Item)
Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney and Budget Director Charlie Harman discussed the budget bill delivered to the governor, which he subsequently vetoed.

HB 200, as enacted,

- Cut Frankfort-based operations by 6.25% (\$3.1 million).
 - Provides \$600,000 in each fiscal year for KFICS
 - Provides \$1,000,000 in each fiscal year for AP/IB test fees for low income students
 - Provides (\$1.75 M) for school technology in coal counties
- Grant line items excluding instructional resources and professional development (LARS) (\$17.4M)
 - Safe Schools receives and additional \$2.6 M each fiscal year
 - Cuts CTE funding by \$2.47 M
 - Fully finds District Health Insurance
- Capital fund maintenance pool reduced by \$1.5M

Houchens clarified that the budget while providing an overall increase, does cut key funding and programs and restricts how new funding can be spent. Harman said 90%+ of new funds are going to schools through an increase in SEEK.

- LARS (projects for districts or other partners) cut \$17.4M.
 - LARS includes \$40 M for Career and Technical education in its base. Any cuts are detrimental since 53 ATCs do not get regular SEEK appropriations.

- SEEK provides for \$4,000 per pupil in each fiscal year, up from \$3,981
 - In the current fiscal year, we have a \$20 M surplus in SEEK due to lack of growth. HB 200EN sets aside \$7 of this for Emergency Revolving School Loan Fund to support districts hard hit by a decline in unmined coal tax, the rest lapses to the General Fund.

Houchens asked if some of the nearly \$13 of unexpended SEEK funds could support LARS reduction. Kinney said the department supports this idea and is advocating for that.

- SEEK fully funds a district's teacher pension contribution. KDE pays the majority of the Teacher's Retirement System (TRS) pension contribution directly rather than sending it to districts to pay. Same for district health insurance.
- SEEK transportation is funded at about 61% of calculated costs, the same as currently. In the next biennium, any surplus would go to support SEEK pupil transportation.

Also in the budget,, \$10.1 M is allocated to districts that lost money for unmined mineral assessments. There are a total of 31 districts impacted by this. 14 districts lost \$100,000 or more.

Program elimination in the budget included:

- Instructional resources (\$16.7M) – textbooks and other instruction devices for K-8 students
- Professional development for teachers, administrators and superintendents (\$11.9M)
- Commonwealth School Improvement fund (1.36M) – used to support schools needing assistance includes State Assistance/Management, Education Recovery and other targeted interventions as required by ESSA
- Leadership and Mentor fund (\$329K)
- Middle School Academic Achievement Fund (\$339K)
- Teachers Professional Growth Fund (\$720K)
- Teacher Academies (\$1.4M)
- Writing Program (\$534K)

Gimmel asked what impact the reduction on school improvement funds would make. Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster says it will have a big impact especially with more schools identified for help under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Under the law, Kentucky cannot supplant state funds with federal funds.

Gimmel asked if taking audits and other school improvement efforts private would save money. Foster responded that she did not believe that it would. The department is still required to pay the bill, and there was no money allocated in the budget for this.

Marcum said it sounds like going forward school improvement efforts will be based more on what we can afford, rather than what we need to do to support schools. Pruitt said he is not sure we can meet a federal requirement to support bottom 5% of schools.

Harman reported there is some good news:

- Full equalization for recallable nickels that were equalized at 24% in the previous budget.
- Additional flexibility for capital outlay funds is to be used for general operating costs (not to exceed 25% of available capital funds in 2018-19)
- Program flexibility for the use of ESS and Safe Schools funds
- Option to publish district annual financial statements and school report card in a way other than the newspaper

Kinney said she believes it will be very difficult for the department to deliver the quality of support for districts that they need.

XVIII. Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee – Conference Room 516

Chair Gary Houchens called the meeting to order at 2:50 p.m. Sam Hinkle, Alesa Johnson, and Nawanna Privett were present along with board chair Mary Gwen Wheeler. Advisors Tracy Cusick, Kathy Gornik and Wayne Lewis also joined the meeting.

A. Action/Discussion Items

1. Waiver Request from Mt. Sterling Elementary School (Montgomery County Public Schools) for Alternative School-Based Decision Making (SBDM) Model - KDE Associate Commissioner Kelly Foster

Asking for non-classified staff to be on SBDM

Sam Hinkle Moved and Alesa Johnson seconded a motion to approve the waiver request from Mt. Sterling Elementary School for Alternative School-Based Decision Making Model. The motion was approved on a unanimous voice vote.

2. Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education (CTE) Act of 2006 (State Plan for 2018-2019) - KDE Associate Commissioner, Laura Arnold and Karla Tipton from the Office of Career and Technical Education, presented.

Tipton said they are leaving the state plan as is, but are asking for approval of requested goals for 2018-19, which reflect an increase of 2% from last year.

As for spending, Tipton said the plan is to distribute 85% to schools and postsecondary institutions, 10% for state level activities, and 5% for administration of the funds.

Alesa Johnson asked what we are doing to improve non-traditional participation and completion in CTE.

Tipton said one of the things that we started to do is revive summer camps at Area Technology Centers that offer hands-on activities in areas students might not think of going into such as men in health science and women in welding. They had 220 students and 12 camps last year. Arnold states that under Perkins we have to use

\$60,000 for nontraditional to support camps. She said increasing access to students is also the goal of the New Skills for Youth (NSFY) program. She cited the example of Fayette Co., where the new Fredrick Douglass High School is based on career academies, and thre district is expanding technical centers.

Wheeler said it might be helpful to have a presentation on career academy pathways in the Jefferson Co. Public Schools, where 13 out of 23 comprehensive high schools will be academies.

Alesa Johnson said highlighting best practices such as this could show business and industry are responding.

Nawanna Privett moved, and Sam Hinkle seconded a motion to approve the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act of 2006 (State Plan for 2018-2019). The motion was approved on a unanimous voice vote.

B. Review Items

- 1. 704 KAR 3:306, Kentucky Academic Standards for Historical and Cultural Influences of the Bible Elective Social Studies Course (Review Item: First Reading - 45 minutes) - KDE Associate Commissioner Amanda Ellis and KDE Deputy General Counsel Todd Allen and Jennifer Fraker, Director, Office of Teaching and Learning.**

Associate Commissioner Ellis indicated that we do not usually don't write standards for elective courses but that HB 128 (2017) required this. Students are not required to take this course. It is an elective for a student in 9 grade or above.

Regulation adopts into law the Kentucky Academic Standards for Historical and Cultural Influences of the Bible Elective Social Studies Course.

Attorney Todd Allen said any course offering has to follow applicable laws and federal and state guidelines in maintaining religious neutrality. Courses are secular and shall not endorse, favor, promote and particular religion or faith.

This is not a new course and has been taught in several schools before. The difference is that this establishes standards for the course.

Timeline -- Received several thousand comments, many unrelated to actual standards.

Writers wanted to ensure standards were flexible and appropriate. The architecture of the standards includes three strands: disciplinary literacy, historical thinking and analyzing influences.

Lewis questioned the standard that requires the examination of other religious texts and whether that was necessary. Houchens says it goes seem to go above and beyond what course is meant to be. Lewis says examining Bible in the context in other religions is one thing but a mandatory examination of other religious texts

may change the course.

Lewis says he believes KDE did a good job with the standards.

Ellis says focus groups emphasized teaching about religion vs. teaching religious beliefs and the separation of the two.

Houchens says when considering religious text, there is a difference between a scholarly approach and a devotional approach (what you do in a worship setting) versus what you do in an academic setting. Houchens likes the inclusion of the word interplay between the Bible and cultural expressions which makes it clear it is a two-way interchange – they both reflect and influence the culture from which they emanate. However, under historical thinking, the standard under HT1 makes it sound like it is a one-way connection. Houchens suggests rather than analyze the influence of changing the wording to analyzing the interplay between economic and political, etc.

Ellis said the process is that staff will make adjustments and bring back to board for second reading.

Houchens congratulated staff on developing a broad framework while staying in constitutional guardrails.

Alesa Johnson moved, and Nawanna Privett seconded a motion to adjourn. Committee adjourned following a unanimous voice vote.

XIX. Management Committee – State Board Room (#514)

Chair Ben Cundiff called the meeting to order at 2:49 p.m. Bill Twyman, Grayson Boyd, Milton Seymore and Roger Marcum were present. Rich Gimmel joined the committee later in the meeting. Member Advisor Joe Papillia also joined the committee meeting.

A. Action/Discussion Items

1. Request from Marshall County School District for Waiver of 702 KAR 7:140, Section 4

Marshall Co is requesting a waiver to the 20-day minimum requirement before it can ask for an emergency day without having to make up the day. The request stems from the district not holding school the day after the Marshall Co. High School shooting (Jan. 24, 2018).

Grayson Boyd moved, and Milton Seymore seconded a motion to approve the Request from Marshall County School District for Waiver of 702 KAR 7:140, Section 4.

The motion was approved on a voice vote of all in favor, none opposed.

2. Request from the Fort Thomas Independent School District for Waiver of 702

KAR 5:060, Section 6(2) - KDE Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney and Director Donna Duncan

The district is requesting a one year waiver to be able to charter school buses to transport students to extracurricular activities and special events without having to go to the local board each time with the request. The district is small and does not have regular school buses that can be used for this purpose. Director Donna Duncan told the committee the district only uses buses that meet state specifications, drivers are trained and that the district carries the required insurance. The district has completed a cost comparison, and it is much more cost effective to charter buses.

Grayson Boyd moved, and Bill Twyman seconded a motion to approve them Request from the Fort Thomas Independent School District for Waiver of 702 KAR 5:060, Section 6(2).

The motion was approved on a voice vote of all in favor, none opposed.

3. Kentucky High School Athletics Association (KHSAA) Board of Control Appointment - KDE Associate Commissioner and General Counsel Kevin Brown

Brown reported that each year KBE appoints an at-large member to the KHSAA Board of Control. This person cannot be an employee of the department or local school districts. There were three applicants. However, two of the applicants were not qualified because they work for a local school district. The third was the current at-large member, Pete Galloway who is eligible for a second term.

Roger Marcum moved, and Grayson Boyd seconded a motion to approve the Appointment of Pete Galloway to the Kentucky High School Athletics Association (KHSAA) Board of Control.

The motion was approved on a voice vote of all in favor, none opposed.

XVIII.B. Review Items

XVIII.B.1. Status Update on State Management in Breathitt and Menifee County School Districts - KDE Associate Commissioners Kelly Foster and Robin Kinney

Breathitt Co. Update

State Manager Mike Murphy updated the KBE on progress in the district. Accompanying Murphy were the chair and vice chair of the Breathitt Co. Board of Education and superintendent Phillip Watts. Murphy provided the following highlights:

- The district in collaboration with the Jackson Police Department will be placing a School Resource Officer, a retired state police officer, into the school.
- The contingency fund is up to 6.5%, an increase over previous years thanks to hard work and being very frugal. Murphy said it is a good thing the district's contingency was at that level since recently the district had to replace a chiller at the school at the cost of \$130,000.

- District architects are looking at designing vestibules at the schools to increase safety and security.
- Staff training for emergencies is being scheduled with Kentucky State Police and the Jackson Police Department.
- The BG1 has been approved for Phase I of a new Area Technology Center.
- The district has chosen Positive Behavior Intervention and Support (PBIS) districtwide to focus on student behavior.
- In the past year, the district has reconfigured Sebastian Middle School and consolidated it with the high school, making it a 7-12 center. This has allowed the district to offer some classes it has not been able to in the past several years.

Watts added that the district successfully passed a nickel tax, which will bring in an additional \$6 million. He said the district also stands to get more than \$321,000 through legislative action on the unmined mineral tax.

Twyman asked about the attitude of teachers and students headed into state testing. Murphy responded that it was very focused. Watts added that recently 31 students at the middle school tested out of intervention and are back on grade level.

Board Chair Ruschelle Hamilton said things have been going very well and that staff is behind the students, and they are getting the community behind the schools. Academics are much improved with several schools of distinction. Watts said keeping students first is at its core.

Marcum asked if the department had not been involved to the extent it has, could they have made the improvement they have. Chair Hamilton said yes, they did have to have help, but in the last two years, they have gained much support from the district's teachers and community and that the focus is now on what's best for kids.

Menifee Co. Update

State Manager Tim Spencer cited the following the improvements in Menifee Co.

- When the district went under state management, the cash balance was \$415,000 with a contingency of \$165,000. As of now, the cash balance is a little over \$1.8 M with a contingency of about \$1M.
- The district has brought in a lot of outside resources through grants – \$1.6M in grants (21st Century, Striving Readers and Gear Up) in the past year.
- The community passed a nickel tax, and with equalization, this will increase bonding capacity to \$7.1M. Also through HB 200, the district could receive urgent needs money that would add another \$7.5 M to its bonding capacity and would allow the district to build a K-8 and close an elementary school.

- District staff has been taking active shooter training with Kentucky State Police as the try to increase school safety.
- The district is looking at adding PBIS and Response to Intervention Strategies in the schools for the 2018-19 school year.
- The district is setting aside money for a 1:1 technology initiative for grades 5-12 and purchasing laptops for staff members.
- There are two new principals, one at the high school and one at Menifee Elementary. Spencer reported the culture is phenomenal at both schools and thinks that will be reflected in test scores.

Board member Twyman said improvement is a marathon, not a sprint and he is impressed with the progress made in both Menifee and Breathitt Cos.

XVIII.B.2. Audit Report of the Commissioner and KBE Expenses for July-December 2017 - KDE Associate Commissioner Robin Kinney and Budget Director Charlie Harman

Harman reported there were two findings during this audit cycle. The first dealt with the distribution of SEEK funds. HB 142 changed the discrepancy in the law, so the first item should no longer be an issue. The second finding deals with lack of documentation in policies and procedures in the distribution of CNIPS (accounting system for School and Community Nutrition) funds. Harman said this has already been corrected and won't be an issue again.

For first six months of the year, the board expenses ran about 50% for the year. The commissioner's expenses also were at 50%.

Grayson Boyd moved to approve the report. Milton Seymore seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in favor. The management committee ended at 3:32 p.m.

With no other business at hand, Grayson Boyd moved, and Roger Marcum seconded a motion to adjourn the Management Committee meeting. The voice vote was unanimous in favor

XIX. Report of the Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment Committee

At 3:38 p.m., Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler called the full board back into session

Committee Chair Gary Houchens, on behalf of the committee, moved approval of 2018-19 State Perkins plan and also a waiver request from Mt. Sterling Elementary in Montgomery Co. for an alternative School Based Decision Making Council (SBDM) model to include classified staff. The committee recommends approval. No second is needed since the motion came as a recommendation from the committee. The board approved the recommendation on a unanimous voice vote.

XX. Report of the Management Committee

Committee Chair Ben Cundiff reported the Management Committee recommended approval of the Request from Marshall County School District for Waiver of 702 KAR 7:140, Section 4; Request from the Fort Thomas Independent School District for Waiver of 702 KAR 5:060, Section 6(2); Kentucky High School Athletics Association (KHSAA) Board of Control Appointment.

No second was needed since the motion came as a recommendation from the committee.

The board approved the committee recommendation on a voice vote.

XXI. National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) Discussion

Associate Commissioner Rhonda Sims, State NAEP coordinator Mark DeCandia and Director Kevin Hill presented results from the 2017 NAEP assessments in reading and mathematics at 4th and 8th grade. This is the first year the assessment has been online. The National Center on Education Statistics claims that studies show the trend line has been protected and computer administration did not have an impact, though studies and raw data have not been released. Other independent studies imply there was an impact. NAEP is administered during a six week window starting in January. A random sampling of students (about 12,400 students from 305 schools, including 94 schools in Jefferson Co., in 111 districts) took the assessment. Students take the assessment in only one content area. Jefferson Co. is one of 27 large districts across the country that participates in the Trial Urban District Assessment (TUDA) and is the only district in the state that receives district level data.

At reading grade 4, the Kentucky scale score declined from 228 to 224, but remain 3 points ahead of national average of 221 and ranks 17. This decline is the only area where the difference from 2015 to 2017 is statistically significant.

From 2011 – 2017, the rate of students with disabilities and English language learners excluded from taking NAEP decreased significantly. In Grade 4 reading, the exclusion rate dropped from 9% to 3% and are now much more in line with the nation. NAEP does not offer an alternate assessment. Kentucky had allowed the accommodation of readers on assessments but has since changed policies and procedures to eliminate these and come into closer alignment with NAEP.

At grade 8 reading Kentucky scores dropped from 268 to 265, which is the same as the national average and ranks in 31st place.

In 4th-grade math, Kentucky dropped from 242 to 239, the same as the national average and ranked the state 29th. Gaps widened across the nation in 4th grade mathematics as in Kentucky.

In 8th grade math, Kentucky scored the same 278 as in 2015, but remains below the nation average of 282, putting Kentucky in 37th place.

Advisor Wayne Lewis asked why the decision was made to show students at basic and above, not proficient and above. Pruitt said the National Governing Board has always presented at this level. Lewis said it is deceiving since basic implies partial mastery.

Sims outlined several areas of concern including the fact that Kentucky still tests using a paper and pencil format. She said the state needs to go online with its assessments.

XXII. Board Member Sharing

Nothing was brought forward.

XXIII. Internal Board Business

Mary Gwen Wheeler asked parting board members for comments.

Roger Marcum thanked Gov. Beshear for the opportunity to serve and the respect he shows educators and his dedication to public education. He said it was an honor to serve with all the board members and acknowledged Dr. Holliday's contribution and more professional approach to the work. Marcum said the board's greatest accomplishment was bringing Dr. Pruitt to Kentucky and hopes he gets the chance to fulfill his commitment that this is his last job until retirement.

Marcum has concerns going forward and whether we have the resources to meet expectations set for students and schools. He wishes we could get back to a point where we respect educators and value their work. Marcum says Kentucky has made a lot of progress and people disrespect this. He hopes that KBE continues making decisions that are student centered and not politically driven.

Nawanna Privett agrees with Marcum. She said she has been privileged to serve last six years and see the gratifying work done by Kentucky educators and KDE leaders. Privett trusts that leaders will continue to be invited to KDE meetings to share progress made by our children. She thinks it is very troubling that programs eliminated in the budget are those that would increase educator expertise and said we have a dedication from educators but need to continue to support them to take us beyond our current plateau. Privett commends Commissioner Pruitt for his leadership on developing the new accountability system and future work on graduation requirements. She wishes other board members well and feels fortunate to have been a part of the work.

Bill Twyman thanks everyone and says everyone has a role to play in education. Twyman thanks commissioner Pruitt and said he is the one to lead us through tough times. He appreciates the staff and the opportunity to serve as board chair. Twyman would like to urge respect for teachers. He is concerned about KDE capacity and school improvement efforts. He appreciates the opportunity to serve.

Grayson Boyd thanked Gov. Beshear for appointing him as well as current and former board members. Boyd said he started as a teacher at age 22 and there was no support. He is afraid we are now going back to that. Boyd thanked Commissioner Pruitt and Dr. Holliday for "putting up with me." He said he would be paying close attention to high school graduation requirements because something needed to be done.

On a personal note, Boyd said he better understands and appreciates state board of education now that he has served on it. He said the staff is awesome and Commissioner Pruitt is lucky to have the staff he has. Boyd says he is concerned that the new pension system will not attract the new teachers that we need and that it will drive some teachers away. It bothers Boyd that teachers do not get the respect that they deserve. He points to contributions teachers make out of their pocket to help students succeed, and the state does not fund educating children and the level they deserve.

Sam Hinkle is grateful for the opportunity to serve the board and be around fine people on the board and department and their commitment to children. One of the best things the board did is hire the commissioner, and he is glad to have had a part of it. Hinkle complimented board members for their fine work. For the future, hopes the board does more of discussing big picture issues such as graduation requirements. Important to keep that in mind to move state and children forward.

Ben Cundiff says it has been interesting serving on the board and believes he is being reappointed.

Mary Gwen Wheeler thanked the staff and said she is appreciative of the dedication of the board members. She said they had tough times, but is positive and hopeful about next steps for education in the state. Wheeler commended the Commissioner for his five priorities moving forward and says it is important that we air our grievances. She said the only way we move forward is to work together. Wheeler said it is important that we reach the goal so all can reach their full potential.

XXIV. Adjournment

Chair Mary Gwen Wheeler entertained a motion for adjournment. Ben Cundiff moved, and Sam Hinkle seconded the motion to adjourn. The motion passed on a unanimous voice vote. The board adjourned at 5:18 p.m. ET